

## *Comment and Response*

### **Editor's Introduction**

*David Elder*  
*Morningside College*

In 2005, I started working with *YSW* as an undergraduate researcher. Then-editor Laurie Grobman guided me to publish an article titled “Chris Rock: Epideictic Rhetor” in volume 3. Since then, I have worked with the journal as a peer reviewer, then as a faculty advising editor, and now as editor of the Comment and Response section. It has been a smooth transition for me because I feel my entire relationship to *YSW* has been one of comment and response, and it has come full circle—first receiving comments and responding to them while revising my article, then giving comments as a peer reviewer and a faculty advising editor, and now again receiving comments on articles published in the journal I’ve associated myself with for seven years.

The Comment and Response articles *YSW* received this year were, once again, excellent. I continue to be amazed by the deftness with which undergraduates respond to their peers’ writing. It was a pleasure to work with these undergraduate researchers on their submissions because the process of revision has never been more real to me than it was when working on revisions with students who are commenting on peers’ published articles. Writing isn’t static or personal; it is constantly being revised even after the original author has a piece published, and the C&R pieces in volume 9 are a great example of this type of re-vision.

The Comment and Response section for the current volume contains responses to articles from volumes 7 and 8. Three of the pieces respond to main articles and one responds to a Spotlight on First-Year Writing article. Andrianna Lee Lawrence comments on Shannon Baldo’s “Elves and Extremism: The Use of Fantasy in the Radical Environmentalist Movement” from volume 7. Lawrence’s response questions whether Baldo’s characterization of environmental activists matches the movement as a whole or just a small subsection of activists. She expands Baldo’s work by including more groups and a new methodology for investigating their rhetoric. Stephen Howard carries on the dialogue started in volume 7 with Monique Shetayh’s article “Wrapped Up in the Online World: Technology, Communication, Blogging, and Youth Today.” In his response, Howard explores “the slimy underbelly of the Internet” and the effect it can have on students using online tools in a classroom. Nicole Passa continues Robin Martin’s provocative work in “Rhetoric of Teacher Comments on Student Writing,” included in volume 8. Passa adds a theory of meaning-making by Ann Berthoff to help us all understand what teachers are doing when they comment on students’ papers and what students can do with the comments during revision. Finally, Savannah Ray explores the rational, logos-based arguments that can be found in music by analyzing the same songs Karen Anton included in her essay “‘My Country! ’Tis of Thee, Strong Hold of Slavery’: The Musical Rhetoric of the American Antislavery Movement” from volume 7. Ray’s response adds a layer of rhetorical complexity to the analysis. The

responses included in this volume are all thoughtful, insightful, and add depth to the already great scholarship found in *YSW*.

I want to thank the on-site faculty who helped their students through the publication process. Even though they have been recognized in this section in the past, I again extend *YSW*'s gratitude to Dr. Elaine Hays (College of the Holy Cross) and Dr. Sean O'Rourke (Furman University) for their great work encouraging students to engage in scholarly dialogue with our journal. Their enthusiasm for teaching shows up in the excellent work produced by their students, and their devotion to *YSW* is greatly appreciated.